



Observations on the Hipparion Red Clays of the Loess Plateau

Citation

Flynn, Lawrence J., Deng Tao, Wang Yang, Xie Guangpu, Hou Sukuan, Pang Libo, Mu Yongqing. 2011. Observations on the Hipparion Red Clays of the Loess Plateau. *Vertebrata Palasiatica* 49, no. 3: 275-284.

Published Version

<http://www.ivpp.cas.cn/cbw/gjzdwxb/xbwzxz/201108/P020110812571602498445.pdf>

Permanent link

<http://nrs.harvard.edu/urn-3:HUL.InstRepos:34325479>

Terms of Use

This article was downloaded from Harvard University's DASH repository, and is made available under the terms and conditions applicable to Open Access Policy Articles, as set forth at <http://nrs.harvard.edu/urn-3:HUL.InstRepos:dash.current.terms-of-use#OAP>

Share Your Story

The Harvard community has made this article openly available.
Please share how this access benefits you. [Submit a story](#).

[Accessibility](#)

Observations on the *Hipparion* Red Clays of the Loess Plateau

Lawrence J. Flynn¹, Deng Tao², Wang Yang³, Xie Guangpu⁴,
Hou Sukuan², Pang Libo², Mu Yongqing⁵

(1 *Peabody Museum, Harvard University, Cambridge MA 02138 USA*)

(2 *Institute of Vertebrate Paleontology and Paleoanthropology, Chinese Academy of Sciences Beijing 100044*)

(3 *Department of Earth, Ocean, and Atmospheric Science, Florida State University and National High Magnetic Field Laboratory, Tallahassee, Florida 32306 USA*)

(4 *Natural Science Department, Gansu Provincial Museum, No 3 Xijingxi Road, Lanzhou 730050*)

(5 *Yushe County Museum, Shanxi Province*)

Abstract

We discuss the history of exploration of Red Clay vertebrate fossils of the Loess Plateau, and record observations on “*Hipparion* Red Clay” localities of Shanxi and Gansu provinces. Red clay is widespread across the Loess Plateau, but misleading as a descriptive term because many deposits are neither red nor dominated by clay-size sediment. Many red clay sequences contain paleosols, but also water-laid deposits. Our survey includes well-known localities of Yushe Basin, Renjiagou and Leijiahe near Lingtai, and sites of Qingyang and Qin’an. We discuss fossils found at Renjiagou, a new discovery of micromammals (*Pliopentalagus*) from Yucun, and Pliocene burrows observed at Hu Jia Cun, both latter localities northeast of Lingtai. Observations are consistent with a high rate of supply of clay sized particles, likely air-fall origin, throughout the Loess Plateau during the late Miocene. In some areas where fluvial or lake processes dominate, red clay particles are replaced in part or completely by water-laid coarse-grained deposits. We saw no evidence for a dry Late Miocene-Early Pliocene, but rather hypothesize well-watered habitat of high productivity. Locally diverse vertebrate fossils attest to high terrestrial biomass for *Hipparion* faunas.

1 Introduction

The late Cenozoic rocks and faunas of northern China have been the subject of considerable study during the last century due to their widespread nature and contained vertebrate fossils. Interest intensified in these fossiliferous deposits during the last quarter century with the application of modern biostratigraphic and magnetostratigraphic techniques (Tedford, 1995). Truly impressive in North China, from Shanxi to Gansu provinces, is the thick blanket of Pleistocene loess, which dates in places to about 2.5 Ma (Burbank and Li, 1985) or older. Early in the 20th century, geologists recognized that silt-sand-gravel deposits below the loess were widespread and attested to an interval of time between early Pleistocene deposits of Zhoukoudian and Nihewan (faunas containing *Equus* and elephantids) and older Eocene and Oligocene strata yielding archaic elements. These later Tertiary sediments contained distinctive fossil assemblages characterized commonly by the three-toed horse *Hipparion* (now *Hippotherium* and derived subgenera) and by cervids, gazelles, and hyaenids. The ages of these intermediate faunas were considered to represent mostly Pliocene and part of late Miocene time (Andersson, 1923), with the conclusion that deposits with fossils of earlier Miocene time had not yet been found in China. It is now understood that *Hipparion* faunas span the entire late Miocene

(6 million years) as well as Pliocene time (Zhang et al., 2002), and that the assemblages characteristic of the changed climate of the early Pleistocene date to about 2.6 Ma.

For Andersson (1922, 1923) one key finding of his previous several years of work for the Geological Survey of China, was the ubiquitous nature of Tertiary deposits older than the Pleistocene. He characterized them mainly by the common occurrence of *Hipparion*, and noted that the sediments often included red clays. Other westerners also were conducting field observations and were impressed by the reddish fine-grained, but variable, deposits. Teilhard de Chardin (1922) noted pre-loess “terres rouges” that were found by his colleague Emile Licent to produce well preserved fossils. Zdansky (1923) conducted studies of the “*Hipparion* Lehm” (clays) of Baode. Quickly embedded in the literature, these deposits were often referred to in English as the “*Hipparion* Clays”, or the “*Hipparion* Red Clays”, or “*Hipparion* Red Earth”.

In ironic contrast, hipparionine assemblages came to be best known from non-red sand-silt deposits of Yushe Basin, Shanxi Province (Qiu, 1987). The fluvial and lacustrine Yushe sequence sets the standard for the biostratigraphy of the latest Miocene through Pliocene interval (Tedford et al., 1991). Licent and Trassaert (1935) recognized three superposed Zones represented by distinctive assemblages in the Yushe Basin. The multiple fossil horizons of the upper two Zones of Yushe Basin ultimately became the basis for the Yushean land mammal age (Qiu and Qiu, 1995; currently subdivided as Gaozhuangian and Mazegouan), which spans the entire Pliocene. This biochronology is repeatedly observed elsewhere in China and westward, and is therefore highly useful.

However, the *Hipparion* red clays remain enigmatic in their widespread nature and apparent transition with overlying loess. Indeed in recent years, loessic deposits have been noted at Lingtai and claimed to predate Pleistocene loess, not just into the Pliocene but well into the Miocene (Zheng et al., 1992; Zhang et al., 1999; Guo et al., 2001). In Gansu Province, other red deposits have been claimed to represent loess as old as the early Miocene (Guo et al., 2002). To what degree of aeolian origin are these ancient deposits, does this mode of deposition span a vast area of northern China during the Miocene, and what scale of lateral variation is observed in the Neogene of the region? Through field reconnaissance in 2008, our group sought to contrast red clay deposits with the Yushe sequence, and to revisit the classic “terres rouges” of North China, especially as represented at Qingyang, the rich accumulation quarried by Licent in the 1920s. It should be noted that some of our observations have been made previously by specialist students of Neogene paleontology and geology in China. We supplement them here, largely for the international audience.

Figure 1. Map showing Yushe Basin and Gansu localities.

2 Yushe Basin

The Yushe sequence in Shanxi Province, specifically the deposits of the Yuncu subbasin, is well discussed by Qiu (1987) and Tedford et al. (1991). Guided by one of us (Mu) we collected mammalian fossils for isotopic studies from Late Miocene and younger horizons that may provide clues to interpret degree of aridity and seasonality of moisture

during the late Neogene in this area of China, on the eastern margin of the Loess Plateau. The local stratigraphic sequence is a succession of dominantly fluvial sediments spanning about 6.5 to 2 Ma. The lowest unit is the Miocene Mahui Fm., dominated by sands and gravels, fining upwards and ending with greenish thin clay units and yellow marls. The successive Gaozhuang Fm. is mostly sand in its lower half, then fining upwards with repeated cycles of cross-bedded sands to silts to purple mudstones and marls. Above this is the Mazegou Fm., which is generally finer grained, with fewer sands, again drab to purplish in color. These beds dip gently to the northwest. The superposed and horizontal Haiyan Fm. is thinner and partly lacustrine in origin, mostly silts and green clays. Being reversely magnetized, it corresponds to the early Matuyama magnetochron (Chron C2r.2r). All of these units produce fossils. The Haiyan Fm. records *Equus* assemblages comparable to the Nihewan fauna (Qiu, 1987; Zone 3 of Licent and Trassaert, 1935). Older units record a succession of hipparionine assemblages that demonstrate time depth of such deposits and represent Zone 1 and Zone 2 of Licent and Trassaert (1935).

While loess deposition was active to the west on the Loess Plateau, during the end of the Pliocene and the early Pleistocene, fluvial and lake deposits (Haiyan Fm.) were aggrading in Yushe Basin. Finally, the Yushe sequence (including Haiyan Fm.) underwent erosion, and became blanketed by later early Pleistocene red loess and overlying yellow loess. Micromammals from the red loess indicate Gongwanglingian age (Flynn et al. 1997) and indicate that by about 1 Ma, loess deposition was under way in this eastern part of the Loess Plateau.

The Yushe sequence presents a Miocene-Pliocene biostratigraphy that can be duplicated elsewhere (e.g., in Gansu Province, Zheng and Zhang, 2001). It establishes that the vertebrate faunas of the late Neogene, which are dominated by hipparionine faunas, show change over time, which is reflected in successive land mammal units. It shows further that the vertebrate assemblages are preserved in drab-colored fluvial sands and silts, hardly the “red clays” one might expect to encounter given a rich literature on “*Hipparion*” beds. Finally, it shows that this mode of fluvio-lacustrine deposition continued into the early Pleistocene, well after red loess was being deposited to the west.

3 Gansu Basins

Lingtai (Fig 1) is situated in the heart of the Loess Plateau, in eastern Gansu, very near Shaanxi Province. Near the town of Lingtai is a long section, a great pile of red clays and silts with well-developed paleosols, especially near the top. This section is clearly what one might think of as “terres rouges”. Zhang Yunxiang et al. (1999) measured and studied a well-exposed section in excess of 300 m at Renjiagou. Paleomagnetic analysis shows normally magnetized sediment at the base of the section, which was interpreted as the top of chron C3Br1n, 7.25 Ma (Gradstein et al., 2004 time scale). Thus red clay and sand deposition in this section began in the late Miocene. The top 170 m of the 300 m Renjiagou section is brownish loess with well-developed paleosols. Below that is a thick series of red clays with some soils, calcareous nodules and occasional sands. Sands increase downward, with even a few thin gravels toward the base. The beds below the brownish loess have been compared with a similar lithological succession some 300 km to the east where the Jingle Fm. (red clays) overlies the reddish, sandier Baode Fm. in

Shanxi Province. The similarity is provocative, but does not demonstrate a simultaneous depositional regime all across North China. To the south of Lingtai, a study by Han et al. (2002) on pre-loess red clays argues that the “Jingle” equivalent beds of Lingtai were dominantly of aeolian origin, albeit accreted at a slow rate. Therefore, the Renjiagou red beds are generally thought of as loess-like, and aeolian deposition characterized the entire Pliocene, at least. The sedimentation rate was higher for the Pleistocene loess than the Miocene-Pliocene deposits.

The contact of loess dominated by brownish paleosols and the underlying red clay is approximately the C2r/C2An (Matuyama/Gauss) boundary. Zhang et al. (1999) recovered typical Pliocene faunal elements from lower in the red clays (*Nyctereutes sinensis*, *Plesiohipparion houfenense*, *Paracamelus*, *Gazella blacki*, and *Antilospira licenti*) at a level correlated to chron C2An3n, about 3.5 Ma. They found one rodent *Chardinomys* sp., which is consistent with this. In the course of our brief survey, at about the 225 m level of the Zhang et al. (1999) section, about 4.3 Ma on the Gradstein et al. (2004) time scale, we discovered a few small mammal remains: *Ochotona* at the small end of the size range for *Ochotona lagreli* (length of m1-3 = 3.65 mm), a leporid molar in a dentary fragment, and a siphneine rodent: cf. *Prosiphneus eriksoni* (IVPP 18016.1-18016.3) represented by two jaws and a humerus. The humerus shows the typical burrowing morphology of zokors. Lingually, the lower molars show moderate dentine tract development (Fig. 2) and buccally, a tract barely intersects the occlusal surface at the protoconid. *P. eriksoni* is a conservative latest Miocene-early Pliocene form known from Ertemte and Harr Obo, Inner Mongolia; Zheng Shaohua identified the material without bias of knowing the provenance. These taxa are consistent with the estimated age.

Figure 2. Dental remains of *Pliopentalagus* cf. *P. huainanensis* from Yucun, and *Prosiphneus* cf. *P. eriksoni* from Renjiagou, near Lingtai, both Gansu Province.

The localities of Leijiahe, worked by Zheng Shaohua and colleagues over a number of years, yield a rich succession of micromammal fossils. This area is in Lingtai County, only about 20 km from Renjiagou, but lithologically quite different. The longest section is only about 65 m thick, but thought to encompass about the same time range as Renjiagou. Therefore, it is a relatively condensed section. Unlike Renjiagou, it is dominated by silty sand, laterally variable and conglomeratic in places, with varied colors and thickness from one exposure to the next. Zheng and Zhang (2001) reported a number of small mammal levels, late Miocene to late Pliocene. There are also abundant large mammals in some of the sand units, including hipparionine associations. In the Renjiagou clays, a few small mammal jaws are preserved in the paleosols. At Leijiahe, rich small mammal assemblages can be retrieved by screening the silty sands. This different mode of accumulation and fossil preservation shows that a model of uniform deposition of a thick air-fall blanket of silt does not apply here. If aeolian deposition began in North China during the late Miocene or earlier, then the model must allow different local modes of deposition.

During our reconnaissance, we benefitted from the local skill and experience of Mr. Li Hongju (Longdong University), who led us to Xiejiacun, which empties into the Jing

River. He took us to a site where a proboscidean tusk had been extracted. The tusk was found in a massive sandstone layer underlying a thick (~3-4 m) conglomerate, the latter in turn overlain by yellow loess. We found scant remains, including equid and antelope fragments, at this site. As at Leijiahe, there was no indication of red clays. Mr. Li also led us to nearby Yucun, another dominantly sand section. This exposure is used as a source of sand for construction, and produces large vertebrates. There are at least two fining-upward sequences of gravel to sand to silty sand. Sand units are on the order of 1 to 3 m thick, cross bedded or massive. Poorly sorted pebbly sands with silt produce bone, including horses and bovids, and notably a p3 of *Pliopentalagus* (IVPP 18017). This tooth (13 mm height, length x width = 3.25 x 2.80 mm), similar to material under study by Jin Changzhu, represents late Miocene *Pliopentalagus huainanensis* or possibly a primitive population of early Pliocene *P. dajushanensis* Tomida and Jin (2009). The single Yucun specimen is probably late Miocene in age, but is consistent as a minor variant of the early Pliocene species; a larger sample would help this assessment. Again, this is a *Hipparion* fauna without red clays.

Northeast of Lingtai, near Ningxian, Gansu, Mr. Li (joined by Prof. Zhou Tianlin) guided us to a valley exposing a thick accumulation of brown silts. This is the general area that has yielded small mammals previously (Zhang, 1999), which indicate early Pliocene age. Taxa include a derived species of *Pseudomeriones*, a zokor close to *Mesosiphneus praetingi*, *Paralactaga* cf. *P. anderssoni*, and *Ochotona lagreli*, and these correspond to microfaunas of Yushe Basin that date to ca. 4 Ma. The origin of the brown silts may be primarily aeolian with possible fluvial contribution of fine grained overbank deposits and considerable organic content. This lithology differs from that of the contemporaneous Jingle Fm. A striking aspect of the brown silts is the presence in the gully Hu Jia Cun of prominent, mature paleosols, some exceeding 20 cm in thickness. Time for development of paleosols attests to substantial hiatuses in deposition. There are well developed burrow systems, primarily vertical shafts, representing the fossorial behavior of, most likely, the zokor *Mesosiphneus*. Shaft diameters are typically 4-5 cm, but some expand to > 10 cm, where nesting or food storage chambers were located. We reproduce here a section exposing burrows (Fig. 3). Vertical shafts penetrate well over a meter deep, through several paleosols. They appear to begin at a horizon that at some point (perhaps later in time) became calcified as calcrete.

Figure 3. Sketch of *Mesosiphneus* burrows at Hu Jia Cun

Exposures near Qingyang, north of Ningxian, are the classic “terres rouges” that yielded a rich *Hipparion* fauna to the efforts of Emile Licent in the 1920s. Qiu (1987) revised the systematics of horses from Qingyang and Yushe. Qingyang (“King-Yang-Hsien”) became Zdansky’s locality 116w, from which a hyaenid fossil became the type specimen of *Chasmaporthetes exitelus* Kurtén and Werdelin, 1988. This is also the type locality of the gerbil *Pseudomeriones abbreviatus* (Teilhard de Chardin, 1926), an occurrence not duplicated there by modern field collection. We relocated the fossil bed by using Licent’s field notes, transcribed as a long set of volumes of limited publication, a copy of which is preserved in the IVPP archives. Licent’s journal refers to the old “Qingyang” now known as Qingcheng; present day Qingyang is a new city. The long Xin Jia Gou, a

stream followed by Licent, is the key; loess lies on Mesozoic rock for much of its way, but upstream there is intervening reddish sand. Near the village Yin Ping Cun, the section is just as Licent describes it: a massive well-sorted sand body, light brick-red in color and over 10 m thick. One to two meters above its base is a bone bed, 0.5 m thick, with fossil mammals dense enough for quarrying, as did Licent, and as do dragon bone hunters today. J G Andersson may have also quarried there, augmenting the Lagrelius Collection. At the base of the bone bed occurs a silty-sand unit with small bone that could be productive if washed. The “*Hipparion*” fauna of Qingyang evidently occurs in water-laid sand and silt, possibly with a wind-blown dust component. The age of this locality is not yet precisely determined, but Qiu (1987) compared the horses from Qingyang to those from localities of Baode that are dated to about 6.5 to 7.2 Ma (Zhu et al., 2008).

From easternmost Gansu, we drove west to Qin'an, north of Tianshui. Qin'an is a vast basin with many areas already known to produce fossils. IVPP, under the leadership of Liu Liping, has developed an ongoing research program there. The potential is to develop a continuous fossil sequence spanning the entire Miocene epoch. Superposed, densely sampled vertebrate horizons could offer a new level of precision in defining and understanding Chinese mammalian biochrons. Guo et al. (2002) previously studied a 22 m.y. section (near Qianwan) interpreted as mainly aeolian in origin. Its paleomagnetic dating is supported by several consistent small mammal fossil assemblages. The length of the section is impressive and thought to represent nearly continuous, if slow, sedimentation. In one 253 m section, 231 reddish layers show soil structures and are associated with carbonate nodules, and are interpreted to represent paleosols that developed subaerially. The section is taken to indicate a moderate rate of loess deposition back to its 22 Ma base. A high rate of sediment accumulation began about 3.5 Ma and lasted to present. How much of the earlier Miocene sediment originated as air fall silt is controversial (we observed what we thought were pond marls and green clays). Although Qiang et al. (2011) call for early desertification of this region, Alonso-Zara et al. (2009) interpret early Late Miocene sediments as mudflat-lacustrine, rejecting an aeolian environment of deposition, but supporting a semi-arid habitat for the region at that time.

In Tianshui we visited the Yaodian section of Li Jijun et al. (2006). This 240 m section is late Miocene in age, correlated to chrons C3An.2n to C5An.2n, about 6.5 to 12 Ma. A well represented fauna containing *Hipparion weihoense* occurs at about 10.5 Ma. The top units are clearly dominated by lake deposits: reddish-brown mudstones with yellowish calcareous mudstones and greenish marlite, thinly bedded. Alternating red and green clays (previously compared to ‘zebra beds’ of Linxia Basin) attest to a long, continuous interval of lacustrine environment (interpreted to span 9.2 to 7.4 Ma). Lower sediments show a fluvial regime, with a cluster of cross bedded sands at about 11.5 to 10.4 Ma. Generally, these become finer upward and the section becomes dominated by mainly overbank deposits of red-brown silts with yellowish marlites and some paleosols. Li et al (2006) interprets basal units to represent floodplain overbank deposits, and these include pond deposits, periodically evaporated, and reminiscent of upper units. The “*Hipparion* fauna” in the Yaodian section is one that clearly does not occur in loess, and is not representative of the classic red clays. It would be useful to analyze lateral variability of deposits to compare with Guo’s section.

Sujiawa in Gansu presents another red silt sequence that includes minor amounts of fine sands without evident lake deposits. This thick accumulation seems to reflect the widespread, but not universal, occurrence of fine-grained to sandy Miocene deposits on the Loess Plateau. It has yielded fossil material of a *Hipparion* red clay assemblage.

4 Discussion

In China, Neogene fossil vertebrate deposits are often referred to in a shorthand fashion, which is useful in a general context, but of limited descriptive power. The adjective for assemblages is often derived from a dominant faunal element, as is the case for the middle Miocene *Platybelodon* fauna or the Pleistocene *Equus* fauna. As noted above, Chinese “*Hipparion* faunas” occur from about 11 Ma to the late Pliocene. Obscured by this broad designation is that the infrequently sampled early “*Hipparion* faunas” (early Late Miocene) and Pliocene assemblages, are distinct from the widespread late Late Miocene, Baodean age faunas. This is rectified in part by applying different mammal units for them: the revival of Bahean as a mammal unit for earlier *Hipparion* assemblages (Zhang et al., 2002; Deng, 2006), and Yushean (Qiu and Qiu, 1995) for Pliocene assemblages, which is further subdivided by Qiu Zhanxiang and colleagues (Qiu et al. in press).

“*Hipparion*” faunas occur in many sedimentary settings of varied lithology, clay to sand, deep red to drab buff or gray or green. Below the widespread Pleistocene loess of the Loess Plateau many locations display deep red color clays that are Pliocene in age. Examples are the Jingle Formation of Shanxi Province and the Lantian Formation of Shaanxi Province. In many areas, red, fine-grained sediments extend into the late Miocene, and the silt particles are of aeolian origin (Lu et al., 2001; Han et al., 2002; Miao et al., 2004). Kaakinen (2005) shows this style of sedimentation to commence about 6.8 Ma at Lantian, and confirms that the sedimentary regime is consistent with aeolian transport, at that early date, albeit with minor fluvial components low in the Lantian Formation. The dating by Zhang et al. (1999) for Lingtai is similar; there the section above the 7 Ma sand and pebble-bearing layers is dominantly fine red clays. Other localities across the Loess Plateau also indicate aeolian transport of red clays after about 7 Ma (Ding et al., 1998; Guo et al. 2001). Although “*Hipparion*” red clays are widespread, they are not universal, the antithesis being the Yushe sequence that is dominated by drab-colored fluvial sands and silts.

The Loess Plateau is vast, spanning 1000 km of central China. Variation across this region includes relatively greater fluvio-lacustrine influence on the environment of deposition in the western part, the Longzhong Basin. Eastward, the Ordos platform is dominated by clay sized particles and a more obvious aeolian source of fine sediment since the late Miocene (Song et al., 2007). Yushe Basin, in the extreme east of the Loess Plateau, is exceptional because tectonism controlled its depositional regime. Down dropping of the Yushe half-graben established a setting where coarse fluvial sediments dominated any clays provided aerially to the system.

Although northern China Late Miocene deposits are variable in color and sedimentology, Late Miocene “terres rouges” are widespread. One research question concerns why they are frequently but not universally encountered. Another factor is the spotty distribution of the fossil occurrences in the red clays. These deposits may be unfossiliferous through most of their thickness, but have rich local concentrations of bone, as is the case at Qingyang and other Baodean age accumulations. Interpreting these observations depends on how Late Miocene paleohabitat of the Loess Plateau is reconstructed. Earlier prevailing views of mainly dry continental habitat for the Loess Plateau have been challenged by new analyses of mammalian fossils and paleofloras. Hypsodonty changes indicate a moist Loess Plateau during the later Late Miocene (Baodean Age: Liu et al. 2009) and paleofloras argue strongly for wetter-than-present Miocene conditions (Liu et al. 2010). Passey et al. (2009) find evidence from stable isotope analysis of fossil teeth for a humid monsoon forest environment during the Miocene-Pliocene transition in North China.

Our paleoenvironmental model of red clay deposition and fossil preservation hypothesizes that the Miocene of eastern Asia, an area greater than the Loess Plateau, experienced considerable air fall dust accumulation. Red silts, aeolian in origin, were widely available to most sedimentary systems and supplied a component to the sediment record, unless coarser sand dominated and fluvial action carried the silt downstream. The rate of sedimentation was probably high in the Pleistocene, 60 m/m.y. for the loess at Lingtai (Zhang et al. 1999), but lower during the Miocene and Pliocene, 10 to 30 m/m.y. for the Jingle red clay (Zhu et al. 2008). Given aeolian deposition, all areas would have been aggrading, unless they were near water courses. Probably much of the loess plateau was of low relief, and depressions, or waterholes, would have been attractive to vertebrates, large and small, herbivores and carnivores. Probably also in a moist habitat, vegetation growth was highly productive, keeping pace with aggradation. This scenario, then, suggests that depressions in the landscape would be natural sites of accumulation and preservation of bone, most elements dissociated, but occasional articulations preserved. Around waterholes, bone concentration over years could have been great. Trampling would break, but also reorient bones from the horizontal, explaining occasional vertical elements. Trees at such sites would hold predatory birds, which could be the concentrating source for microfaunal elements. This is a scenario of accretion of fauna over time, years to tens of years at single sites, perhaps longer. It is not a catastrophic scenario. Taphonomic field data can be expanded to test the model.

An important ecological role may have been played by fire. Recently, ecologists have focused on the widespread grasslands of the late Miocene and how wildfires functioned to maintain them (Keeley and Rundel 2005). The great role of fire in the ecosystem stands out when considering a high-biomass scenario in which significant fuel was continually generated due to rapid growth, and fire maintained open habitat.

Wind-blown red clay deposits appear to have accumulated in late Miocene settings when other sediment sources were not available. In Gansu Province, we observed vertebrate-bearing sands and silts, mottled or drab yellow and gray in color at various locations, including Leijiahe and Yucun. How can airborne loess be so dominant in one area and

absent 20 km away? Our model sees loess deposition as dominant only where the depositional regime was slow-current. Where coarser sediment was available and higher flow rates dominated, as at Leijiahe, the aeolian red clay comprised a minor component in the accumulation.

As the Neogene of China has become known better, Miocene red clays significantly older than the “*Hipparion* red beds” have been identified. Some of these, as in the Qin’an Basin (Guo et al. 2002) or at Lanzhou, are also dominantly red and show an aeolian contribution to the fine grained component. Whether such deposits of early Miocene age truly represent loess is debatable, but they show that dust was a sediment source in northern China throughout the Neogene. Aeolian sediment does not necessarily invoke desertification. On the contrary, the high diversity in itself of Loess Plateau *Hipparion* faunas stands witness to productivity and high biomass. Rather than representing catastrophic assemblages, we think that aeolian deposition in combination with floodplain aggradation was the norm across North China. Fine-grained sediment accumulated rapidly on low-relief surfaces, burying abundant faunal remains at water holes, natural areas of attraction for vertebrates.

Acknowledgements We thank the staff of IVPP, especially Shi Fuqiao for all of his skills in the field, and the local officials of the areas that were visited on this excursion. Our ideas developed over a long set of conversations and we thank our colleagues at IVPP, the Yushe Museum, and Gansu Province officials, as well as the local inhabitants, for freely sharing observations. Zheng Shaohua and Jin Changzhu kindly offered identifications. We thank Anu Kaakinen, Wang Xiaoming and Mikael Fortelius for their discussions, references, and review of the manuscript. The field work was supported by the National Natural Science Foundation of China (40730210) and the US NSF (EAR 0716186).

References

- Alonso-Zarza, A M, Zhao Z, Song SH, Li J J, Zhang J, Martín-Pérez, A, Martín-García, R, Wang X X, Zhang Y, and Zhang M H. 2009. Mudflat/distal fan and shallow lake sedimentation (upper Vallesian-Turolian) in the Tianshui Basin, Central China: Evidence against the late Miocene eolian loess. *Sedimentary Geology* **222**: 42-51
- Andersson, J G, 1922. Current palaeontological research in China. *Bulletin of the American Museum of Natural History* **46**(13):727~737
- Andersson, J G, 1923. Essays on the Cenozoic of northern China. *The Geological Survey of China, Memoirs (series A)* **3**:1~152
- Barry, J C, Morgan, M E, Flynn, L J, Pilbeam, D, Behrensmeyer, A K, Raza, S M, Khan, I A, Badgley, C, Hicks, J, Kelley, J, 2002. Faunal and Environmental change in the late Miocene Siwaliks of northern Pakistan. *Paleobiology Memoir* 3, *Paleobiology* **28**, Supplement to No. 3: 1~71

- Berggren, W A, Kent, D V, Swisher, C C, III, Aubry, M-P, 1995a. A revised Cenozoic geochronology and chronostratigraphy. In: *Geochronology, Time Scales and Global Stratigraphic Correlations: A unified temporal framework for a historical geology*. SEPM Spec. Publ. **54**: 129~212
- Berggren, W A, Hilgen, F J, Langereis, C G. 1995b, Late Neogene (Pliocene-Pleistocene) chronology: new perspectives in high-resolution stratigraphy. *Geol. Soc. America Bull.* **107**: 1272~1287
- Burbank, D W, Li Jijun, 1985. Age and paleoclimatic significance of the loess of Lanzhou, north China. *Nature* **316**: 429~431
- Chiu C S, Li C K, Chiu, C T, 1979. The Chinese Neogene: a preliminary review of the mammalian localities and faunas. *Annales Géologiques des Pays Helléniques, Hors Ser. 1*: 263~272
- Deng T, 2006, Chinese Neogene Mammal Biochronology. *Vertebrata Palasiatica*, **44**(2): 143~163
- Ding, Z, Sun, J, Liu, T, Zhu, R, Yang, S, and Guo, B, 1998. Wind-blown origin of the Pliocene red clay formation in the central Loess Plateau, China. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, **161**: 135~143
- Flynn, L J, Wu W, and Downs, W R, 1997. Dating vertebrate microfaunas in the late Neogene record of northern China. *Palaeogeogr Palaeoclimatol Palaeoecol*, **133**: 227~242
- Gradstein F, Ogg J, Smith A, 2004.. *A Geologic Time Scale*. Cambridge: Cambridge Univ Press.
- Guo Z T, Peng S, Hao Q Z, Biscaye, P E and Liu T S, 2001. Origin of the Miocene-Pliocene red earth formation at Xifeng in northern China and implications for paleoenvironments. *Palaeogeogr Palaeoclimatol Palaeoecol*, **170**: 11~26
- Guo Z T, Ruddiman, W F, Hao Q Z, Wu H B, Qiao Y S, Zhu R X, Peng S Z, Wei J J, and Liu T S, 2002. Onset of Asian desertification by 22 Myr ago inferred from loess deposits in China. *Nature*, **416**: 159~163
- Han, J, Fyfe, W S, Gu Z. 2002. Assessment of the palaeoclimate during 3.0-2.6 Ma registered by transition of Red Clay to loess-palaeosol sequence in central North China. *Palaeogeogr Palaeoclimatol Palaeoecol*, **185**: 355~368
- Kaakinen, A, 2005. *A long terrestrial sequence in Lantian – a window into the late Neogene palaeoenvironments of northern China*. PhD thesis 183, Department of Geology, University of Helsinki.

- Keeley, J E, Rundel, P W, 2005. Fire and the Miocene expansion of C4 grasslands. *Ecology Letters* 8:683-690.
- Li J J, Zhang J, Song C H, Zhao Z J, Zhang Y, Wang X X, Zhang J M, and Cui Q Y, 2006. Miocene Bahean stratigraphy in the Longzhong Basin, northern central China and its implications in environmental change. *Science in China D: Earth Sciences*, **49**(12):1270~9
- Licent E, Trassaert M, 1935. The Pliocene lacustrine series in central Shansi. *Bulletin of the Geological Survey of China*, **14**(2): 211~219
- Liu L, Eronen J, and Fortelius M, 2009. Significant mid-latitude aridity in the middle Miocene of East Asia. *Palaeogeogr Palaeoclimatol Palaeoecol*, **279**: 201~206
- Liu Y, Utescher T, Zhou Z, and Sun B, 2011 The Evolution of Miocene climates in North China: Preliminary results of quantitative reconstructions from plant fossil records. *Palaeogeogr Palaeoclimatol Palaeoecol*, **2xx**: xx~xx
- Lu H Y, Vandenberg, J, and An Z S. 2001. Aeolian origin and palaeoclimatic implications of the “Red Clay” (North China) as evidenced by grain size distribution. *Journal of Quaternary Science*, **16**: 89-97
- Miao X D, Sun Y B, Lu H Y, and Mason, J B. 2004. Spatial pattern of grain size in the Late Pliocene “Red Clay” deposits (North China) indicates transport by low-level northerly winds. *Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology*, **206**: 149-155
- Passey, B H, Ayliffe, L K, Kaakinen, A, Zhang Z Q, Eronen, J T, Zhu Y M, Zhou, L P, Cerling, T E, and Fortelius, M. 2009. Strengthened East Asian summer monsoons during a period of high-latitude warmth? Isotopic evidence from Mio-Pliocene fossil mammals and soil carbonates from northern China. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, **227**: 443-452
- Qiang X K, An Z S, Song Y G, Chang H, Sun Y B, Liu W G, Ao H, Dong J B, Fu C F, Wu F, Lu F Y, Cai Y J, Zhou W J, Cao J J, Xu X W, Ai L, 2011. New eolian red clay sequence on the western Chinese Loess Plateau linked to onset of Asian desertification about 25 Ma ago. *Science China, Earth Sciences*, **54**(1): 136-144.
- Qiu Z X, 1987. The Chinese Hipparionine Fossils. *Palaeontologia Sinica*, **175**(C25): 1~250, 47 Plates (in Chinese with English summary)
- Qiu Z X, 1989. The Chinese Neogene mammalian biochronology – its correlation with the European Neogene mammalian zonation. In: Lindsay E H, Fahlbusch V, Mein P eds. *European Neogene Mammal Chronology*. NATO ASI series. New York: Plenum. 527~556

- Qiu Z X, Qiu Z D, 1995. Chronological sequence and subdivision of Chinese Neogene mammalian faunas. *Palaeogeogr Palaeoclimatol Palaeoecol*, **116**: 41~70
- Qiu Z X, Wu W Y, Qiu Z D, 1999. Miocene mammal faunal sequence of China: palaeozoogeography and Eurasian relationships. In: Rössner G, Heissig K eds. *The Miocene land mammals of Europe*. München: Verlag Dr. Friedrich Pfeil. 443~455
- Song Y G, Fang X M, Torii M, Ishikawa N, Li J J, An Z S. 2007. Late Neogene rock magnetic record of climatic variation from Chinese eolian sediments related to uplift of the Tibetan Plateau. *Journal of Asian Earth Sciences*, **30**: 324~332
- Tedford, R H, 1995. Neogene mammalian biostratigraphy in China: past, present and future. *Vertebrata PalAsiatica*, **33**: 272~289
- Tedford, R H, Flynn, L J, Qiu, Z, Opdyke, N D, and Downs, W R, 1991. Yushe Basin, China; paleomagnetically calibrated mammalian biostratigraphic standard for the late Neogene of eastern China. *Journal of Vertebrate Paleontology*, **11**(4): 519~526
- Teilhard de Chardin, P, 1922. Sur une faune de Mammifères pontiens provenant de la Chine septentrionale. *C.R. Académie des Sciences, Paris* **175**: 975~981 (in French)
- Teilhard de Chardin, P, 1926. Description de Mammifères Tertiaires de Chine et de Mongolie. *Annales de Paléontologie, Paris*, **15**: 1~52, 4 plates (in French)
- Teilhard de Chardin, P, 1941. Early Man in China. *Institute de Géo-Biologie, Pekin*: 1~99
- Tomida, Y, and Jin C, 2009. Two new species of *Pliopentalagus* (Leporidae, Lagomorpha) from the Pliocene of Anhui Province, China, with a revision of *Pl. huainanensis*. *Vertebrata PalAsiatica*, **47**: 54~71
- Woodburne, M O, 2004. Global Events and the North American Mammalian Biochronology. In: Woodburne M O ed. *Late Cretaceous and Cenozoic mammals of North America: biostratigraphy and geochronology*. New York: Columbia University Press. 315~344
- Zdansky, O, 1923. Fundorte der *Hipparion*-Fauna um Pao-Te-Hsien in NW-Shansi. *Bulletin of the Geological Survey of China*, **5**: 69~81 (in German)
- Zhang Y X, Sun D H, An Z S, and Xue X X, 1999. Mammalian fossils from Late Pliocene (Lower MN 16) of Lingtai, Gansu Province. *Vertebrata PalAsiatica*, **37**(3): 190~199 (in Chinese with English summary)

- Zhang, Z, 1999. Pliocene micromammal fauna from Ningxian, Gansu Province. Proceedings of the seventh annual meeting of the Chinese Society of Vertebrate Paleontology, 167~177 (in Chinese with English summary)
- Zheng, H, An, Z, and Shaw, J, 1992. New contributions to Chinese Plio-Pleistocene magnetostratigraphy. Physics of the Earth and Planetary Interiors, **70**: 146~153
- Zheng S, Zhang Z, 2001. Late Miocene-Early Pleistocene biostratigraphy of the Leijiahe Area, Lingtai, Gansu. Vertebrata Palasiatica, **39**: 215~228 (in Chinese with English summary)
- Zhu, Y, Zhou, L, Mo, D, Kaakinen, A, Zhang, Z, and Fortelius, M, 2008. A new magnetostratigraphic framework for late Neogene *Hipparion* Red Clay in the eastern Loess Plateau of China. Palaeogeogr Palaeoclimatol Palaeoecol, **268**: 47~57

FIGURE CAPTIONS

- Figure 1. Map showing location of Yushe Basin, Shanxi Province, with respect to basins and localities in Gansu Province.
- Figure 2. Dental remains of *Pliopentalagus* cf. *P. huainanensis* (A, IVPP 18017) and *Prosiphneus* cf. *P. eriksoni* (B, C; IVPP 18016.1). A, left p3 from Yucun showing distribution of enamel (black) and cementum (stippled); there is a small pit in the dentine posterior to the anterior reentrant. B, C, occlusal and lingual views of right m1-m2 from Renjiagou, near Lingtai. Scales = 1 mm.
- Figure 3. Section at Hu Jia Cun with multiple paleosols intersecting resistant, filled burrows, probably dug by the zokor *Mesosiphneus*.